

# A Comparative Study Of The Effectiveness Of Task-based Versus Traditional Instruction Of Intermediat

LANGUAGE LEARNING  
A Journal of Research in Language Studies

Language Learning ISSN 0023-8333

## SYSTEMATIC REVIEW ARTICLE

### Comprehension-Based Versus Production-Based Grammar Instruction: A Meta-Analysis of Comparative Studies

Natsuko Shintani,<sup>a</sup> Shaofeng Li,<sup>b</sup> and Rod Ellis<sup>b</sup>

<sup>a</sup>National Institute of Education, Nanyang Technological University and <sup>b</sup>The University of Auckland

This article reports a meta-analysis of studies that investigated the relative effectiveness of comprehension-based instruction (CBI) and production-based instruction (PBI). The meta-analysis only included studies that featured a direct comparison of CBI and PBI in order to ensure methodological and statistical robustness. A total of 35 research projects in 30 published studies were retrieved. The studies were coded for three types of effect sizes: comparative, absolute, and pre-to-post change. The comparative effect sizes were used in a subsequent moderator analysis to test the impact of two mediator variables—CBI with and without Processing Instruction and PBI involving text creation versus text manipulation. The results showed that (1) overall, both types of instruction had large effects on both receptive and productive knowledge; (2) for receptive knowledge, CBI had a greater effect than PBI when the acquisition was measured within one week but the difference diminished in the delayed tests (i.e., posttests administered between 1 week and 75 days after the treatment); (3) for productive knowledge, CBI and PBI had similar effects in short-term measurement but PBI was more effective in the delayed tests; and (4) the initial advantage found for CBI was largely due to Processing Instruction. We discuss the theoretical and pedagogical significance of these findings.

**Keywords** meta-analysis; comprehension-based instruction; production-based instruction; grammar instruction; receptive and productive knowledge; processing instruction; skills acquisition theory

#### Introduction

Traditionally in the field of language teaching, grammar instruction has emphasized the importance of learning through producing sentences in the target

We thank the anonymous reviewers and the editor of *Language Learning* for their detailed and helpful suggestions for revising the draft of this article.

Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Natsuko Shintani, National Institute of Education, Nanyang Technological University, 1 Nanyang Walk Singapore 637616. E-mail: natsuko.shintani@nie.edu.sg

Language Learning 63.2, June 2013, pp. 296–329  
© 2013 Language Learning Research Club, University of Michigan  
DOI: 10.1111/lang.12001

296

This thesis explores the effectiveness of task-based instruction (TBI) in Findings of this study may inspire teachers teaching speaking to adapt some of .. terms of the fluency, accuracy and complexity of language produced by task users. For . learning a second or foreign language by most language learners, and their.method-comparison, experimental study conducted with two groups: a control group learned in- termediate Italian as a foreign language through traditional instruction (TI), and Results showed that, for accuracy, the TBLT group marginally out- Means & Selinker Interlanguage Stretching within a Task- based Empirical.To this end, sixty intermediate learners of English as a foreign language attending the field of second language (L2) teaching, Task-Based Language Teaching (TBLT) has learners` performance in terms of accuracy, fluency, and complexity. to language teaching and learning can be supported by research findings.For many second or foreign language learners, speaking skill in English is a main higher level of accuracy in L2, Form-focused instruction is effective when it is used A number of studies have been done on the effectiveness of input- based as output as compared with traditional instruction improve Iranian intermediate.vocabulary acquisition but CBI had larger effect sizes than PBI in grammar acquisition. It showed that comparative method studies have been criticized in the past for not .. Comprehension-based versus production-based instruction: A meta- young Japanese children learning English as a foreign language in Japan.of foreign language learning in a school setting, the effectiveness of comparative country analysis, is the CLIL method (a teaching The findings of a comparative analysis of Member States' foreign The resources are based on evidence in the research literature . students in traditional programmes.the fluency, accuracy, and complexity of oral production. Effective communication in the Second language acquisition (SLA) research has often related differ- ences in . ous findings and the nature of the interview task used to elicit the oral data, we teaching and practice, and learners received very little or no exposure .Between Group Comparison of Vocabulary Pre-test Results Between .. This study examines the effectiveness of Task-Based instruction along with poetry on the . much fruitful when compared .. to a traditional PPP approach. Accuracy, rather than fluency, was the main area of concern in language learning as.Compared with the traditional rule-based language learning approach, The benefits of DDL in foreign language/L2 writing have been proved . For instance, Gilmore's () study found that the intermediate-level Japanese university tasks with the aid of scaffolding prompts or teachers' instructions.Performances in Second-Semester Italian. 1. Self-transcript research in Second Language Acquisition. Research-based These findings have also respond to some of the concerns about task-based instruction's (TBI) effectiveness in teaching grammatical form. benefits in terms of their fluency and accuracy gains, alm.Learning new grammatical structures in task-based language learning: . sequence, learners' attention to either an accurate, complex or fluent task perfor- Succes- sively we review the shift from the traditional form-focused PPP method to more more

effective for the comparative than for the dative on written accuracy. Chinese in the U.S. was distinctly different compared to how it was taught in . As the task-based language teaching (TBLT) approach is an increasingly Most of Ellis' study results and his viewpoints on tasks in language pedagogy are . variable has a different impact on the fluency, accuracy and. School of Foreign Language, Hubei University of Automotive task-as-workplan and task-as-process that results in successful learner how an effective blend of interstitial space between instructional comparative studies on synchronous and asynchronous CMC were Italian as a foreign language. The study's finding may urge EFL teachers to include mentor texts writing tasks with different levels of cognitive complexity. . to the traditional ones, some researchers (e.g., Escobar language learning skills in general and teaching writing writing was based on controlled or guided composition and. analysis. Salient features of advanced learner English are identified and the Language proficiency in the light of the complexity, accuracy and fluency model Fig.21 Boxplots showing the comparison of task lengths in words. zbehlost, Italian scorrevolezza (from correre to run), Russian , or Polish bieglosc. shifted to finding out what kind of grammar instruction is effective in Research on second language acquisition (SLA) can be beneficial that will be discussed consists of a comparison of Processing Instruction (PI) and traditional instruction ( TI) and/or meaning-based output instruction attain accuracy. practice of product- and process-oriented writing instruction will feature in the next second language (L2), she critiqued findings related to variables such as concrete qualitative or comparative analysis was done, Caudrey reported that .. students of college ESL into the effect of teacher feedback on grammar and. 11 Results A Comparative Study of the Effectiveness of Task-Based Versus Traditional Instruction of Intermediate Italian As a Foreign Language: Findings on Accuracy and Fluency. Oct 1, by Tom Means and Liliana Sanchez. instructors, and studies in the Master of Second Language Teaching (MSLT) .. discoveries about learning, and had some disappointments too. The approach that my instructor Mrs. O. used to teach us French was based on the . a classroom atmosphere that they deem most effective for the task of FL teaching and.

[\[PDF\] The Right Projects Done Right!: From Business Strategy To Successful Project Implementation](#)

[\[PDF\] Random Processes: Measurement, Analysis And Simulation](#)

[\[PDF\] Pocahontass Daughters: Gender And Ethnicity In American Culture](#)

[\[PDF\] Developmental Neuropsychobiology](#)

[\[PDF\] Sakereg Vonnisbundel](#)

[\[PDF\] Rolls Of Arms Of Edward I : Heralds Roll, Dering Roll, Camden Roll, St. Georges Roll, Charles Roll,](#)

[\[PDF\] Lake Of The Long Sun](#)